



Year: 2016

Effects of different media on the enrichment of low numbers of Shiga toxin-producing *Escherichia coli* in mung bean sprouts and on the development of the sprout microbiome

Margot, Heike ; Tasara, Taurai ; Zwietering, M H ; Joosten, Han ; Stephan, Roger

Abstract: Sprouted seeds have been implicated in a number of serious outbreaks caused by *Salmonella* and Shiga toxin-producing *Escherichia coli*. Sprouts pose a very complex challenge to bacterial pathogen enrichment and detection since they naturally contain high levels of background microflora including members of the Enterobacteriaceae. As such, the currently used method cannot ensure reliable detection of STEC in sprouts. In this study, we compared different media for the enrichment of Enterobacteriaceae in their ability to promote the growth of stressed STEC at 37°C and 42°C. Mung bean sprouts were spiked with low levels of STEC and their growth was recorded over time. In addition, the microbiome of mung bean sprouts was analysed before and after enrichment. Our results indicate that the growth of dry-stressed STEC is comparable in all of the tested enrichment media except for mTSB+Novobiocin and not influenced by the incubation temperature. Low levels of STEC spiked into the sprouts resuspended in media only grew to levels of around 4logcfu/ml during enrichment, which could reduce the probability of detection. Proteobacteria was the dominant phylum detected within the microbiome of non-enriched mung bean sprouts. During enrichment in EE-broth, Proteobacteria remained the most abundant phylum. In contrast, during enrichment in BPW the relative abundance of Proteobacteria decreased whereas Firmicutes increased when compared to the non-enriched mung bean sprout microbiome. The microbiome composition was not significantly influenced by the incubation temperature during enrichment in both BPW and EE-broth. This is the first study to examine the microbiome on sprouted mung bean seeds during BPW and EE enrichment and relates the bacterial community composition changes to the enrichment of pathogens.

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2016.05.005>

Posted at the Zurich Open Repository and Archive, University of Zurich

ZORA URL: <https://doi.org/10.5167/uzh-130007>

Journal Article

Accepted Version



The following work is licensed under a Creative Commons: Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International (CC BY-NC-ND 4.0) License.

Originally published at:

Margot, Heike; Tasara, Taurai; Zwietering, M H; Joosten, Han; Stephan, Roger (2016). Effects of different media on the enrichment of low numbers of Shiga toxin-producing *Escherichia coli* in mung bean sprouts and on the development of the sprout microbiome. *International Journal of Food Microbiology*, 232:26-34. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2016.05.005>

**Evaluation of different buffered peptone water (BPW) based enrichment broths
for detection of Gram-negative foodborne pathogens from various food matrices**

H. Margot¹, M.H. Zwietering², H. Joosten³, Emer O'Mahony⁴, R. Stephan¹

¹Institute for Food Safety and Hygiene, Vetsuisse Faculty University of Zurich, CH-8057
Zurich, Switzerland

²Laboratory of Food Microbiology, Wageningen University, 6700 AA Wageningen, the
Netherlands

³European Chair in Food Safety Microbiology, Wageningen University, 6700 AA
Wageningen, the Netherlands

⁴Quality and Safety Department, Nestlé Research Center, Vers-chez-les-Blanc, CH-1000
Lausanne, Switzerland

* Corresponding author:

R. Stephan, Institute for Food Safety and Hygiene, Vetsuisse Faculty University of Zurich,
Winterthurerstr. 272, CH-8057 Zurich, Switzerland, Phone 0041-44-6358651, fax 0041-44-
6358908, e-mail stephanr@fsafety.uzh.ch

Abstract (max 400 words)

This study evaluated the effects of changing the composition of the pre-enrichment medium buffered peptone water (BPW) on the growth of stressed and unstressed Gram-negative foodborne pathogens in a one-broth enrichment strategy. BPW supplemented with an available iron source and sodium pyruvate, along with low levels of 8- hydroxyquinoline and sodium deoxycholate (BPW-S) improved the recovery of desiccated *Cronobacter* spp. from powdered infant formula. Growth of *Salmonella* and STEC was comparable in all BPW variants tested for different food matrices. In products with high levels of Gram-negative background flora (e.g. sprouts), the target organisms could not be reliably detected by PCR in any of the BPW variants tested unless the initial level exceeded 10^3 cfu/10g of sprouts. Based on these results we suggest BPW-S for a one-broth enrichment strategy of stressed Gram-negative foodborne pathogens from dry products. However, a one-broth enrichment strategy based on BPW variants tested in this evaluation is not recommended for produce with a high level of Gram-negative background flora due to very high detection limits.

Keywords: pre-enrichment, one-broth strategy, supplements, resuscitation, *Salmonella*, STEC, *Cronobacter*, *Enterobacteriaceae*

1. Introduction

Key to the reliability of all methods for the detection of Gram-negative foodborne pathogens (e.g. *Salmonella*, *Cronobacter* and Shigatoxin-producing *E. coli*) is the capability to recover low numbers of stressed cells from any kind of food matrix to a detectable level. These methods usually consist of three consecutive steps. The pre-enrichment step, that is common to most current detection methodologies (cultural, molecular and immunological), aims at the resuscitation/ recovery of cells in a non-selective medium such as buffered peptone water (BPW). The second step, a selective enrichment, should promote growth of the recovered target bacteria. The last step, the actual detection of the pathogen can be accomplished with either cultural or molecular methods.

Gram-negative foodborne pathogens are usually present in relatively low numbers, sometimes accompanied by a high number of closely related competitor organisms (Baylis et al., 2000). In addition, cells may be sub lethally injured by food processing or intrinsic factors of the food matrix (Edel and Kampelmacher, 1973). The purpose of the pre-enrichment step is to allow stressed target microorganisms to resuscitate and grow in either a non-selective or moderately selective environment. At this stage, the target organisms can be overgrown by the background flora in the food product due to absent selectivity of the medium, which can lead to false negative results.

The selective enrichment should promote growth of the recovered target bacteria. The necessity of applying a selective enrichment will mostly depend on the characteristics of the food product, particularly on its microbial flora. In products with a high number of competing organisms, in which the target bacteria are likely to be stressed, both a non-selective and selective enrichment step will be necessary. For products with low levels of background flora, a one-broth enrichment strategy in an unselective enrichment broth can be sufficient. Since the pre-enrichment and selective enrichment step are the main time limiting factors in

75 regards to turn around time for rapid methods (Baylis et al., 2000), a moderately selective
76 one-broth enrichment strategy can decrease the total time until results are available.

77 The success of the pre- enrichment step is however not only depending on the food product
78 but also on the quality of the medium. Preliminary work has shown that there are some
79 inconsistencies in the performance of BPW and that the ISO standard formulation results in
80 performance variations not just from manufacturer to manufacturer but also from batch to
81 batch. A comparison of 18 different commercially brands of buffered peptone water showed
82 differences in performance regarding buffering capacity, growth of unstressed bacteria and
83 recovery of dry-stressed cells (unpublished data). The performance of the BPW brands
84 depended heavily on the matrix and the organism tested. Baylis et al. (2000) compared two
85 commercially available preparations of buffered peptone water with regards to their ability to
86 promote recovery and growth of sub-lethally injured *S. enterica*. There was a significantly
87 higher recovery rate stressed of cells with one brand of buffered peptone water however, the
88 performance of BPW in food was mostly dependent on the food type with the type and level
89 of background flora present being the most important influential factors. Strain variability
90 also exerted an influence on the recovery of stressed cells. Different studies have investigated
91 an improvement of enrichment media by supplementation and by modification of the
92 conditions during enrichment such as temperature, pH, time etc. (Andrews et al., 1986). Gray
93 et al. (2006) investigated the effect of variation between classes of casein, gelatine and
94 peptones from different sources. They concluded that the variation in peptone has a
95 substantial influence when looking at growth and enumeration of bacteria. For STEC, pre-
96 enrichment methods were developed based on meat industry requirements that are, however,
97 inadequate for the recovery of STEC from vegetables, flour and other low a_w matrices (Sata et
98 al., 2003). Weber et al. (2009) showed that the supplementation of growth factors such as
99 additional iron and sodium pyruvate, along with low levels of inhibiting agents primarily

against Gram-positive background flora (8- hydroxyquinoline and sodium deoxycholate), enhances the recovery rate of stressed cells.

Products containing starter cultures and probiotic cultures present a special challenge to pathogen detection. Strong acidification of the enrichment caused by lactic acid producing bacteria can lead to inactivation of target bacteria and subsequently false-negative results. Previous experimental work has shown that increased concentrations of buffer phosphates in BPW improved detection of pathogens in powders containing probiotics (unpublished data). For this reason, BPW with 3x and 6x increase in buffer phosphate concentration were included in the study. So far, there are only few studies evaluating the use of BPW with supplements in a one-broth enrichment. In particular, data obtained from experiments in the food matrix are scarce.

The aim of the current study was to compare different modifications of BPW with regard to their ability to promote growth of unstressed and stressed Gram-negative foodborne pathogens in different food matrices.

2. Materials and methods

2.1. Bacterial strains

Different *Salmonella enterica*, *Cronobacter* spp. and Shigatoxin-producing *Escherichia coli* (STEC) strains were chosen as representatives for Gram-negative food borne pathogens (Table 1). Working cultures were made from frozen (-80°C) BHI (Oxoid CM1135, Basingstoke, United Kingdom) with 20% glycerol stocks and maintained on blood agar plates (Difco Columbia blood agar base, 5% sheep blood, CM0031 Oxoid) at 4± 1°C. All strains were natural isolates, obtained from our in-house collection.

2.2 Supplementation of BPW

Buffered peptone water (BPW, Oxoid CM1049) was prepared according to the manufacturer's instructions. BPW-S was prepared by using BPW with the following supplements added before autoclaving: 40 μ M 8- hydroxyquinoline, 0.5 g/l ammonium-iron(III) citrate, 0.1 g/l sodium deoxycholate, 0.1g /l sodium pyruvate (all from Sigma-Aldrich, Buchs, Switzerland).

6xBPW (quantities for 3xBPW in brackets) was prepared by addition of 7.5 g/l (3 g/l) KH_2PO_4 and 17.5 g/l (7 g/l) Na_2HPO_4 (anhydrous) (Sigma-Aldrich) to BPW. 6xBPW-S contains both additional buffer salts and supplements of BPW-S. Throughout this work, buffered peptone water from a single batch was used to avoid lot-to-lot variations.

2.3 Recovery of dry stressed cells

Each ten strains of *Cronobacter* spp., STEC and *S. enterica* were grown overnight in 9 ml BHI (Oxoid) at 37°C. Grown cultures were centrifuged at 13000 g for 10 min. The supernatant was discarded and the pellet was re-suspended in 1 ml BPW. The cell suspension with cell counts of approximately 10^9 - 10^{10} cfu/ml was serially tenfold diluted in BPW. 10 μ l of each dilution were pipetted in eight wells of a 96- well microtiter plate using one plate per strain resulting in 10^7 - 10^8 cfu/well in the first row. Cell counts of the culture were determined with plate counts on tryptic soy agar (BD Diagnostic Systems, Heidelberg, Germany). After two days of storage in a desiccator containing silica gel at room temperature, one complete plate was rehydrated with 200 μ l BPW, BPW-S or 3xBPW per well and incubated 16 ± 2 h at 37°C. The most probable number (MPN) of microorganisms that had survived the drying process and were able to grow in the enrichment broth was determined based on the number of wells in which growth was observed using the Bacteriological Analytical Manual *Online* MPN table.

(<http://www.fda.gov/Food/FoodScienceResearch/LaboratoryMethods/ucm109656.htm>)

2.4 Application of desiccation stress

In food matrices with a low a_w , pathogens are expected to have encountered desiccation stress. To achieve a more realistic scenario, cells used for spiking were desiccation stressed before inoculation.

The STEC K124 and 33, *Cronobacter* spp. E615 and E776, *S. enterica* N10 1905 and N472 962 strains were grown separately overnight in 30 ml BHI (Oxoid) at 37°C. After centrifugation for 12 min at 4000 rpm and the supernatant was discarded. The inside of the tube was dried with a sterile cotton swab. Small amounts of sterile CaCO_3 (Sigma-Aldrich) were added to the pellet and mixed vigorously with a spatula until homogeneously distributed. More CaCO_3 was added to a final amount of approximately 15 g of powder. The powder was stored in a desiccator with silica gel for two days. The homogeneity of the powder was verified one day before the actual experiment by weighing five times 0.1 g of powder, diluting in 0.9% saline and plating on selective agar (Rapid *E. coli* 2 agar for *E. coli* (Biorad, Marnes la Coquette, France), X.L.D agar for *S. enterica* (Oxoid), Brilliance *Enterobacter sakazakii* agar for *Cronobacter* spp. (Oxoid)). However, plating on selective agar might have resulted in lower cell counts than those actually found in the powder.

To obtain the desired concentration, 0.1 g of the powder with bacteria was suspended in 0.9% saline, diluted if necessary and added to the enrichment. The spiking levels were checked by enumeration on selective agar.

2.5 Growth of pathogens inoculated into food enrichments

10 g samples of skim milk powder, oat flakes, minced beef, soy sprouts and powdered infant formula (PIF) were diluted 1/10 with the different enrichment media and mixed in a stomacher for 30 s at medium intensity. Food products for one experiment were obtained from the same supplier, if possible originating from the same batch. The samples were inoculated with low levels of the target strain (aiming at 10^1 cfu in 100 ml) and incubated for

18±2 h at 37°C. For spiking with cells without application of stress (for minced beef and sprouts), an overnight culture grown in BHI was diluted to the desired concentration and added to the diluted matrix. In the case of milk powder, oat flakes and PIF, the target strains were desiccation stressed before inoculation, using the protocol described in 2.4. Skimmed milk powder was inoculated with *Salmonella*, oat flakes were inoculated with STEC and *Salmonella*, minced beef was inoculated with STEC, soy sprouts were inoculated with STEC and *S. enterica* and powdered infant formula was inoculated with *Cronobacter* spp. Inoculum levels were confirmed by plate counts on tryptic soy agar. After 4, 8, 15, 20 and 24 h of incubation, samples of each enrichment broth were diluted in 0.9 % saline and plated on the appropriate selective agar. To verify that the used food products were not naturally contaminated with *S. enterica*, *Cronobacter* spp. or STEC, negative controls were incubated and checked for the presence of pathogens by plating on selective agar or by Assurance GDS real-time PCR (Biocontrol, Bellevue, USA). Total aerobic counts and *E. coli*/ coliform counts were determined in the un-inoculated samples by plating them on tryptic soy agar at regular intervals. Minced meat and sprout samples were additionally plated on Rapid` *E. coli* 2 agar (Biorad). All agar plates were aerobically incubated at 37°C for 24±2 h. The pH of the negative control was measured at regular intervals in 6xBPW and BPW-S using a pH meter (Orion Star, Thermofisher Scientific, Reinach, Switzerland). To obtain data after more than 12 h incubation an identical second pre-enrichment broth was prepared in the late afternoon, also incubated at 37°C, and sampled the next day. This approach may result in an increase of the variability.

2.6 Recovery of STEC and *Salmonella* from sprouts

Fresh soy sprouts were obtained from a local Asian supermarket. 10 g samples were diluted 1/10 with BPW, BPW-S and 6xBPW and mixed in a Stomacher for 30 s at medium intensity. Sprouts were spiked with 10, 10², 10³ cfu / sample with *E. coli* (strain K124) and a naturally

nalidixic acid resistant *Salmonella* Kentucky (strain N08 2487) and incubated for 18 ± 2 h at 37°C . Plate counts were performed to confirm the inoculation level. After incubation, the samples were diluted and plated on selective media. Samples inoculated with STEC were plated on Rapid[®] *E. coli* 2 agar (Biorad) and samples inoculated with *S. enterica* were plated on Luria Bertani Agar + 256 $\mu\text{g/ml}$ nalidixic acid sodium salt (Sigma-Aldrich) Plates were incubated for 24 h at 37°C . In addition, presence of the pathogens was tested with the Assurance GDS real-time PCR. An un-inoculated sample was used as a negative control.

2.7 Statistical analysis

Statistical analysis was performed using IBM SPSS. The effect of the enrichment media on the resuscitation of desiccation stressed cells was compared applying one-way ANOVA.

A three-way ANOVA was used to compare the cell counts from the enriched cultures for the four enrichment media, five food matrices and the four organisms.

3. Results and Discussion

3.1. Recovery of desiccated cells

The MPN concentrations (log cfu/ml) after rehydration and incubation for the tested strains using the three enrichment media are shown in Figure 1. *Salmonella* strains were recovered to values reaching from 0.5 log MPN to 4.6 log MPN. The mean MPN counts were 3.6 ± 1.2 , 3.7 ± 1.3 and 3.4 ± 1.3 in BPW, BPW-S and 6xBPW, respectively. Desiccated *Salmonella* strains did not show great variation in regards to the different media. Two strains remained at low cfu levels after rehydration and incubation, which indicates that growth after desiccation was more strain than media dependent. Desiccated STEC strains were recovered to highest concentrations in BPW (mean MPN count 4.1 ± 0.2), showing little strain variation. The mean concentrations in BPW-S and 3xBPW were up to 2.0 log MPN and 0.6 log MPN lower, respectively. There was no statistical significant difference between the media ($P = 0.87$).

229 Highest concentrations for *Cronobacter* strains were recorded in BPW-S (mean MPN count
230 2.5 ± 0.7) and 6xBPW (mean MPN count 3.3 ± 0.9) ($P = 0.06$). However, strain variability
231 resulted in differences in counts of up to 2.5 log MPN. The strains showed least resuscitation
232 in BPW (mean MPN count 3.2 ± 0.5).

233 The positive effect of the combined supplementation of BPW with an iron source, sodium
234 pyruvate and sodium deoxycholate on stressed *Enterobacteriaceae* was already described by
235 Weber et al. (2009). Nevertheless, recovery of desiccated STEC was significantly superior in
236 BPW without supplements ($P < 0.01$). One of the supplements, sodium deoxycholate, is the
237 selective component in bile salts and its use in culture media for the inhibition of Gram-
238 positive organisms and selection of Gram-negatives is well recognized (MacConkey, 1905).
239 However, the negative effect of bile on the detection of stressed pathogens has also been
240 described (D'Mello et al., (1987); Hara-Kudo et al. (2000). A concentration of 1.0 $\mu\text{g/ml}$
241 sodiumdeoxycholate in an agar medium resulted in increased lag time and growth rate of *E.*
242 *coli* and the interference with the flagellation was named as a possible reason by D'Mello et
243 al. (1987). Stephens and Joynson (1998) reported decreased recovery of acid/salt stressed *E.*
244 *coli* O157:H7 in tryptone soya broth when bile salts were added. These findings indicate that
245 bile salts with sodium deoxycholate being the main ingredient can deteriorate the recovery of
246 stressed *E. coli* cells (Stephens and Joynson, 1998).

247 Sodium pyruvate protects stressed bacteria from reactive oxygen species (MacDonald et al.,
248 1983). These can develop in the enrichment broth through auto-oxidation of reducing sugars
249 and cause decreased recovery of stressed cells (Stephens et al., 2000). Sodium pyruvate is
250 able to facilitate the repair process in injured bacteria and can replace the function of catalase
251 in these organisms. No negative effects on any of the organisms tested in our study are
252 described in literature. Therefore the observed inhibitory effect in STEC is most probably not
253 caused by this substance. 8-hydroxyquinoline (8-HQ) was added to the enrichment medium to

replace vancomycin as an inhibitor for Gram-positive competitors as this compound is heat stable and alternatives to antibiotics are desirable. (Weber et al., 2009).

3.2. Maximum population density in the matrix

The maximum population density for each matrix with standard deviation is shown in Figure 2. All food matrices were inoculated with two strains of the same species and the experiments were performed in triplicate. In one experiment, one food product was spiked with one strain and diluted with all tested media. The spiking inoculum was identical for one experiment. However, spiking levels between different replicates can differ which is the main reason for the high standard deviation in some cases. When PIF was spiked with low levels of desiccation stressed *Cronobacter*, highest counts were seen in BPW-S in all experiments. Levels in the other enrichment media were on average 1 log cfu/ml lower than in BPW-S. However, in two of the experiments, counts in 6xBPW and 6xBPW-S were as high as in BPW-S. Overall, the cell counts of *Cronobacter* were not significantly different between the media ($P= 0.06$). Weber et al. (2009) demonstrated the same improved recovery with ten *Cronobacter* spp. strains. They also showed that isolation from other naturally contaminated samples of different origin was enhanced

For skimmed milk powder, *Salmonella* strain N472 962 grew to 9 log cfu/ml in all enrichment media. Variation was small in this case (mean standard deviation= 0.5). Strain N10 905 grew to lower counts in all media and experiments were yielding higher standard deviations (mean standard deviation= 1.3).

STEC strains 33 and K124 spiked into cereals grew to 9 log cfu/ml, independent of the enrichment medium. In contrast to the desiccation experiments (see 3.1.), both STEC strains grew to same concentration in BPW and BPW-S. When *S. enterica* was spiked into cereals,

growth of the target bacteria again was lower in 6xBPW and 6xBPW-S than in BPW and BPW-S with high standard deviation.

Minced meat was spiked with low levels of unstressed bacteria. STEC strain 33 grew to levels of 8 log cfu/ml to 10 log cfu/ml in BPW-S, 6xBPW and 6xBPW-S. Values in BPW were up to 2 log cfu/ml lower. Minced meat was also spiked with *S. enterica*. For both strains, all four media showed the same maximum population density.

The general outcome of the matrix experiments is that both *Salmonella* and STEC strains (with the exemption of K124) did grow to comparable concentrations in all four enrichment media independent of the matrix. This indicates that the food matrix balances the effects of the media supplements, both positive and negative. The results also show that in the matrices tested, *Salmonella*, STEC and *Cronobacter* spp. can be isolated with a one-broth strategy with BPW-S. In food products in which one or more of these three targets have to be tested, one enrichment could be sufficient and omission of a selective enrichment allows time saving. 6xBPW was included in the study because previous experimental work showed that increased buffering capacity enhanced recovery of desiccated cells from products with a high number of lactic acid producing bacteria (e.g. probiotic culture powders) (data not published). We did not find, as expected, an additional benefit in the use of this medium for the products described here.

3.3. Growth in food matrices

The growth of both the pathogens and the background flora was determined in BPW and BPW-S. PH in the enrichment was recorded. All food matrices were inoculated with low levels of the target organism.

The target bacteria and the background flora reached approximately the same final concentration after 24 h for PIF, milk powder, oat flakes and minced meat (Figure 3). For PIF and oat flakes the levels of the background flora was 1 log cfu/ml lower in BPW-S than in

305 BPW throughout the incubation period. These are the products, which have a mainly Gram-
306 positive flora. In PIF, the final number of *Cronobacter* was over 1 log higher in BPW-S. In
307 the other food matrices, there was no obvious difference between the enrichment media in the
308 growth of the selected pathogens. In PIF, oat flakes and minced meat the target organisms
309 reached their final value after 15 h. In milk powder it took 20 h until *Salmonella* reached the
310 maximum numbers.

311 Sprouts were spiked with a higher number of *Salmonella* to enable detection of the target
312 bacteria after the incubation period. It is remarkable that starting from 0 h of incubation, the
313 counts of the background flora are at least 3 log cfu/ml steps higher throughout the
314 enrichment period.

315 Background flora counts in sprouts were very high and values of 7 to 8 log cfu/g in sprouts
316 have already been published by other researches (Jinneman et al., 2012). In contrast to the
317 other matrices used in this study, the background flora of sprouts is mainly composed of
318 Gram-negative organisms and therefore the inhibiting agents in the BPW variants are not
319 effective because they were selected to suppress the Gram-positive flora. Inhibiting effects of
320 the background flora on pathogens like *E. coli* O157 and *Salmonella* have been described
321 previously (Vold et al., 2000, Duffy et al., 1999). An approach explaining this behaviour is
322 the Jameson-effect. According to this model, two species compete for the resources in the
323 environment during their growth. Growth of both populations stops when the resources are
324 depleted or when metabolic products inhibiting growth have accumulated (Cornu et al.,
325 2011). It is possible that this model also applies in sprouts. However, since growth in our
326 experiments was only determined up to 24 h, the growth behaviour of *Salmonella* after this
327 time is not known.

328 In the enrichment of dry food products, pH values remained relatively stable. Only in milk
329 powder did the pH in BPW-S decrease to 5.8. BPW with increased buffer concentration did
330 not completely prevent pH decline but usually kept the pH about 1 point higher. However, pH

decrease did in none of the products reach a level that would inhibit growth of the target bacteria.

3.4. Detection limit in sprouts

Since the above-mentioned experiments indicated that low levels of *Salmonella* and STEC spiked into sprouts could not be recovered, the inoculation level was increased and enrichments were additionally tested with real-time PCR for the presence of the pathogens. These results are summarized in Table 2. *Salmonella* could not be detected by real-time PCR, when sprouts were inoculated with only 10 cfu. However, *Salmonella* counts were 10^4 - 10^5 cfu/ml, which indicates that there was growth of *S. enterica* during the enrichment.

At an inoculation level of 10^2 cfu, PCR results for *Salmonella* were only positive in 6xBPW. At an inoculation level of 10^3 cfu, *Salmonella* was detected with PCR from BPW and 6xBPW and cultural isolation yielded a minimal value of 1.0×10^5 cfu/ml. Nevertheless, levels of 4.0×10^5 cfu/ml of *Salmonella* in BPW-S were not detected in the PCR, even though the test protocol included an immunomagnetic separation step. Hence, at an inoculation level of 10^3 cfu (levels of $\geq 10^5$ cfu/ml after the enrichment step), *Salmonella* could not be consistently detected. This, however, seems not to be due to the different enrichment broths which were evaluated. The high number of accompanying flora and the dilution steps which are applied in the PCR (only small volumes are used) are the reasons for a high detection limit, which seems to be between 10^5 and 10^6 cfu/ml after the enrichment step.

Badosa et al. (2009) have evaluated ISO enrichment real-time PCR methods with different selective enrichment media and found that *Salmonella* was only detected from sprouts in 50% of the cases when the inoculation level was 10 cfu in 25 g. 1 cfu was never detected even though a selective enrichment was performed after the enrichment in BPW. Their method was able to detect 1 cfu in 25 g of other fresh produce. Filtered soy sprout extracts did result in

positive detection for all inoculation levels, which suggest that the high levels of accompanying flora caused the failure of the detection (Badosa et al., 2009). Taking the present data into account, the possible presence of a low dose of *Salmonella* in 25 g of sprouts cannot be reliably detected with a one-broth enrichment strategy. A selective enrichment is necessary to promote selective growth of the target organism and to inhibit the background flora. However, members of the common sprout flora (such as *Citrobacter* spp.) can also grow in selective broths and can be misidentified as *Salmonella* on selective agar.

STEC were neither detected with PCR nor when using Rapid` *E. coli* 2 agar with the lower inoculation levels. Isolation of the STEC strains on agar was only possible with an inoculation level of 10^3 cfu. Still, the PCR result of the enrichment in BPW was negative.

Differences in cultural detection between STEC and *Salmonella* can be explained by different selectivity of the agar media. The *Salmonella* strain was grown on LB agar supplemented with nalidixic acid which suppressed growth of any background flora on the plate. On the other hand, Rapid` *E. coli* 2 agar does only select for coliforms. Since these organisms represent the dominating flora of sprouts with counts of up to 10^5 cfu/g (Becker and Holzapfel, 1997), the small number of *E. coli* present will be overgrown on the agar medium. The single enrichment of sprouts in BPW followed by real-time PCR for the top 6 serotypes (O157, O26, O145, O103, O111, O104) is the recommended ISO protocol for the detection of STEC (ISO/TS 13136:2012). However, our results strongly suggest that low levels of contamination with STEC on sprouts are missed with this procedure. Jinneman et al. (2012) found that the method as described in the U.S. Bacteriological Analytical Manual did detect low levels of *E. coli* O104 from a sprout matrix with different real-time PCR systems. Their enrichment involved addition of acriflavin, cefsulodin and vancomycin and increased incubation temperatures. However, they also reported non-isolation of the target organism on certain selective agars due to overgrowth of background flora.

4. Conclusion

Different buffered peptone water based enrichment broths were tested to evaluate their performance in a one-broth strategy for the detection of Gram-negative food borne pathogens. Desiccation stressed cells showed variable behaviour. Resuscitation of *Cronobacter* spp. was improved in BPW-S but stressed STEC cells did not show an improved recovery in pure culture experiments. When a selection of food products was spiked with low numbers of the pathogens, STEC and *Salmonella* growth was similar in all media. *Cronobacter* spp. detection from PIF was improved with BPW-S. Therefore, we suggest the use of BPW-S in a one-broth enrichment strategy for the isolation of *Cronobacter* spp. from PIF and similar products with low a_w values. Moreover, this broth can be used for the parallel enrichment of *Cronobacter* spp., STEC and *Salmonella* from different food matrices. However, the one-broth strategy was not suitable for produce with high numbers of Gram-negative accompanying microflora. Low numbers of the pathogen will be overgrown by the background flora making their detection impossible. Next should be a thorough validation of the medium according to ISO standards.

References

- Andrews, W.H., 1986. Resuscitation of injured *Salmonella* spp. and coliforms from foods. *Journal of Food Protection* 49, 62-75.
- Badosa, E., Chico, N., Pla, M., Pares, D., Montesinos, E., 2009. Evaluation of ISO enrichment real-time PCR methods with internal amplification control and detection of

409 *Listeria monocytogenes* and *Salmonella enterica* in fresh fruit and vegetables. Letters in
410 Applied Microbiology 49, 105-111.
411

412 Baylis, C.L., MacPhee, S., Betts, R.P., 2000. Comparison of two commercial preparations of
413 buffered peptone water for the recovery and growth of *Salmonella* bacteria from foods.
414 Journal of Applied Microbiology 89, 501-510.
415

416 Becker, B., Holzapfel, W.H., 1997. Mikrobiologisches Risiko von fertigverpackten
417 Keimlingen und Maßnahmen zur Reduzierung ihrer mikrobiellen Belastung. Archiv für
418 Lebensmittelhygiene 48, 73-96.
419

420 Cornu, M., Billoir, E., Bergis, H., Beaufort, A., Zuliani, V., 2011. Modelling microbial
421 competition in food: application the behaviour of *Listeria monocytogenes* and lactic acid flora
422 in pork meat products. Food Microbiology 28, 639-647.
423

424 D'Mello, A., Yotis, W.W., 1987. The action of sodium deoxycholate on *Escherichia coli*.
425 Applied and Environmental Microbiology 53, 1994-6.
426

427 Duffy, G., Whiting, R.C., Sheridan, J.J., 1999. The effect of a competitive microflora, pH and
428 temperature on the growth kinetics of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7. Food Microbiology 16, 299-
429 307.
430

431 Edel, W. and Kampelmacher, E.H., 1973. Comparative studies on the isolation of
432 "sublethally injured" *Salmonellae* in nine European laboratories. Bulletin of the World Health
433 Organization 48, 167-174.
434

435 Gray, V.L., Müller, C.T., Watkins, I.D., Lloyd, D., 2006. Peptones from diverse sources:
 436 pivotal determinants of growth dynamics. *Journal of Applied Microbiology* 104, 554-565.
 437

438 Hara-Kuo, Y., Ikedo, M., Kodaka, H., Nakagawa, H., Goto, K., Masuda, T., Konuma, H.,
 439 Kojima, T., Kumagai, S., 2000. Selective enrichment with a resuscitation step for isolation of
 440 freeze injured *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 from foods. *Applied and Environmental*
 441 *Microbiology* 66, 2866-2872.
 442

443 ISO International Standard 6579, Microbiology of food and animal feeding stuffs- Horizontal
 444 method for the detection of *Salmonella* spp. 4 th edition, 2002-07-15.
 445

446 Jinneman, K., Waite-Cusic, Y.G., Yoshitomi, K. J., 2012. Evaluation of shiga-toxin
 447 producing *Escherichia coli* (STEC) method for the detection and identification of STEC
 448 O104 strains from sprouts. *Food Microbiology* 30, 321-328.
 449

450 MacConkey, A.T., 1905. Lactose-fermenting bacteria in faeces. *International Journal of*
 451 *Hygiene and Environmental Health* 5, 333-379.
 452

453 MacDonald, I.C., Hackney, C.R., Ray, B., 1983. Enhanced recovery of injured *Escherichia*
 454 *coli* by compounds that degrade hydrogen peroxide or block its formation. *Applied and*
 455 *Environmental Microbiology* 45, 360-365.
 456

457 Sata, S., Fujisawa, T., Osawa, R., Iguchi, A., Yamai, A., Shimada, T., 2003. An improved
 458 enrichment broth for isolation of *Escherichia coli* O157, with specific reference to starved
 459 cells, from radish sprouts. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology* 69, 1858-1860.
 460

Stephens, P.J., Joynson, J.A., 1998. Direct inoculation into media containing bile salts and antibiotics is unsuitable for the detection of acid/salt stressed *Escherichia coli* O157:H7. Letters in Applied Microbiology 2, 147-151.

Stephens, P.J., Druggan, P., Nebe-von Caron, G., 2000. Stressed *Salmonella* are exposed to reactive oxygen species from two independent sources during recovery in conventional culture media. International Journal of Food Microbiology 60, 269-285.

Suh, J-H., Knabel, S.J., 2000. Comparison of different enrichment broths and background flora for detection of heat-injured *Listeria monocytogenes* in whole milk. Journal of Food Protection 64, 30-36.

Tamplin, M., 2002. Growth of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 in raw ground beef stored at 10 degrees C and the influence of competitive bacterial flora, strain variation, and fat level. Journal of Food Protection 65, 335-344.

Vold, L., Holck, A., Wasteson, Y., Nissen, H., 2000. High levels of background flora inhibits growth of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 in ground beef. International Journal of Food Microbiology 56, 219-225.

Weber, C., Stephan, R., Druggan, P., Joosten, H., Iversen, C., 2009. Improving the enrichment procedure for *Enterobacteriaceae* detection. Food Microbiology 26, 565-5

<http://www.fda.gov/Food/FoodScienceResearch/LaboratoryMethods/ucm109656.htm>